



Alpine Convention

Platform Large Carnivores, ungulates and society

International workshop

Prevention and Compensation of Damages from Large Carnivores

Domodossola (I)

27-28 February 2018

Workshop report

Inputs collected and summarised by:

Marianna Elmi and Taja Ferjančič Lakota, Permanent Secretariat of the Alpine Convention.

The results presented in the report do not express the view of the Platform “Large Carnivores, ungulates and society” of the Alpine Convention, which has organized the workshop, or the Permanent Secretariat of the Alpine Convention. The report summarises the contributions by all participants. The report can be cited only upon permission.

Aims of the workshop

The international workshop “Prevention and compensation of damages from Large Carnivores” took place in Domodossola (Italy) on 27 and 28 of February 2018.

The event was organized in the framework of the activities of the Alpine Convention Platform “Large Carnivores, Wild Ungulates and Society”, in implementation of the 2017-2018 mandate.

The main objectives of the workshop were:

- Analysing the state-of-art in the Alpine countries: sharing knowledge on prevention and compensation measures for damages by large carnivores already in place in the Alps.
- Setting priorities: identifying effective prevention and compensation measures.
- Identifying challenges: highlighting the main challenges related to effective and efficient systems of prevention and compensation.
- Finding solutions: highlighting possible solutions to the identified challenges, based also on effective systems presented in the state-of-art review.
- Analysing and finding adequate financing tools: deepening the understanding of the use of the European Agricultural Rural Development Fund (EARDF) as well as other financing solutions for damage prevention and compensation.

Some 40 participants from all Alpine countries except Monaco attended the workshop. The complete participant list can be found in attachment 2.

Background: the WISO Platform of the Alpine Convention

The objectives of the Alpine Convention Platform “Large Carnivores, Wild Ungulates and Society” (also called “WISO” as a shortening for “Wildlife and Society”) are to find solutions to manage large carnivores and wild ungulates harmoniously and based on an integrated approach. The Platform goes beyond a strictly ecological approach and endeavours to also address economic and social aspects in a balanced manner.

The Platform was set up by the X. Alpine Conference (Evian, France, 2009). In the years 2017-2018, the mandate of the Platform focuses on the following items: the promotion of information exchange, dialogue and coordination among the Contracting Parties and among authorities, wildlife managers, hunters and foresters; the sustainable damage prevention and compensation, through the report and exchange of national and regional approaches and good practices as well as the analysis of possible application of the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development for financing damage prevention measures; the development of recommendations for internationally coordinated Brown Bear management actions at the Alpine level, taking into account the results of the Life DinAlpBear project and the Bear Alpine Group indications and other relevant initiatives; the further development of programmes for alpine-scale coordinated genetic monitoring of large carnivores and the promotion of initiatives to counteract inbreeding in alpine lynx sub-populations.

At the WISO Platform meeting in Vaduz, Liechtenstein, on 25 and 26 September 2017, the members of the Platform decided to hold a workshop in order to discuss prevention and compensation measures for damages from large

carnivores involving also non-WISO representatives from sectors such as agriculture and protected areas management.

Cooperation with local partners in the framework of the Alpine Convention

The workshop was organized under the coordination of the Permanent Secretariat of the Alpine Convention, currently chairing the Platform, in close cooperation with the Alpine Convention Infopoint in Domodossola, managed by the association “Ars.Uni.VCO”, which hosted the event at its premises.



The workshop was organized as an Alpine Convention “Green Event”. This means that the organization took into account the sustainability of all

parts of the event: from the arrival of the participants, to the recycling of waste, to the use of local and socially responsible companies for the catering services.

Contents of the workshop

The workshop combined three main elements:

- A series of keynote presentations (day 1) on the systems of damage prevention and compensation already existing in the Alpine countries. In cases where the systems are not implemented, the presentations focused on an update on the current status.
- A keynote presentation (day 2) on the use of the European Agricultural Rural Development Fund for financing prevention and compensation measures.
- Two rounds of discussion in small groups. The discussion groups were

organized according to topics relevant in the context of the workshop theme.

- An excursion to a local *agriturismo* - a combined farm-hospitality structure - in order to see first-hand how local farmers and entrepreneurs deal with damages by ungulates. During the excursion, several local organizations and representatives presented their projects and activities.

The detailed programme of the workshop is contained in attachment 1.



Figure 1: group photo of the participants (Ph: Marianna Elmi).

Main results

In the following sections, the main results both of the keynotes and the discussion tables are presented.

Keynotes - day 1 - Presentation of the status quo in the Alpine countries

The first part of the discussion included presentations on the systems of prevention and compensation in the Alpine Countries. All the presentations collected can be accessed (by the participants in the workshop in possession of a username and password) at the following address:

http://static.alpconv.org/down/2/wiso_ws/

The main conclusions that can be drawn from the cases presented are the following:

- There is a substantial heterogeneity in terms of development of prevention and compensation measures among the Alpine countries. It is not possible to speak of an Alpine-wide coverage of harmonised and integrated systems.
- This heterogeneity relates to three main aspects: the level of implementation, the governance and the technical details of the measures implemented.
- Concerning the implementation level, while some Alpine countries have legislation and systems already in place both for prevention and compensation, some other countries are still in the process of elaborating stable systems.
- Concerning governance, there are differences in the systems in place in the different countries, especially in terms of centralization/decentralization and of the responsible actors.
- Finally, concerning the technical details, the presentations showed how the same technical measure (e.g. use of fences) is applied in different ways according to the single country. A technical exchange on solutions already adopted and their effectiveness in the different Alpine countries would be beneficial in this respect.

Discussion tables – days 1 and 2

After the presentation of the situations in the Alpine countries, a series of discussion tables were organized both in the afternoon of day 1 and in the morning of day 2.

On day 1, the following topics were discussed in six groups: communication, prevention and compensation.

On day 2, the following topics were discussed in six groups: communication, prevention, compensation and financing (including EARDF funds).



Figure 2: the moderators reported on the results of each discussion table (Ph: Taja Ferjančič Lakota).

Each group was moderated by one of the participants and worked on the following sets of questions prepared by the organizers.

Discussion tables “communication”

How is your experience concerning communication?

With which stakeholder groups do you usually communicate?

What are the main difficulties/critical points in communicating prevention and compensation possibilities to the stakeholders?

What are the main success factors – what would you recommend doing when communicating?

What can be done to improve dialogue and communication?

Are there groups which should be more involved?

Discussion tables “prevention”

Is there anything you would like to add to the experiences presented? (example from your area/region...)

What are the prevention measures that you currently deem more effective in your

area/region?

What is in your area/region currently hindering the development or the implementation and use of prevention measures?

What are the factors that could contribute to a more effective application of prevention measures?

Discussion tables “compensation”

Is there anything you would like to add to the experiences presented? (example from your area/region...)

Are stakeholders in your area/region familiar with compensation measures? Are they effectively used (if present)?

What is in your area/region currently hindering the full use of compensation measures?

What are the factors that could contribute to a more effective application of compensation measures?

The discussion table on **financing** did not follow a specific set of questions, but rather provided to the participants the possibility to further exchange on national and regional experiences on financing prevention and compensation measures and, at the same time, to analyse success factors and improvement needs and potentials.

The results are presented along the lines of the three topics. Since the issue of financing is transversal to the topics of prevention and compensation, it has been summarised under the respective points.

Communication

The discussions on this topic focused on three main elements: the critical points, the success factors and the relevant stakeholders.

Concerning the critical points, the following were highlighted:

- The plurality of actors to be addressed and their different realities and perceptions (e.g. rural/urban actors).
- The importance of creating a continuous dialogue rather than communicate only when an event occurs.
- The issue of inaccurately researched or sometimes even wrong information circulated.
- The use of terms and approaches which tend to polarise the discussion.

The main stakeholders that are involved in communication processes have been identified as follows: scientist, political representatives from different levels (especially local and regional), managing authorities and protected areas, farmers and agriculture associations, hunters, shepherds, NGOs, journalists, animal rights associations, foresters and urban inhabitants.

The discussion on the topic focused also on possible solutions and success factors for positive communication. The following points can be mentioned:

- Communication is a key element and should be taken in account even before the planning of technical solutions. Communication also contributes to the creation of trust among stakeholders.
- Communication should start before conflicts emerge and communication experts should be appropriately involved in order to spread findings and information. In this respect, there should be a clear identification of who is responsible for providing facts; public authorities have a key role in this.

- It is important to involve all stakeholder categories, and to identify the right level to work with them.
- Several instruments have been discussed for fostering dialogue: mediation and round tables, establishing communication platforms or groups. Small groups are an ideal setting for dialogue.
- Positive experiences, such as peer-to-peer testimonials, can contribute to creating a fruitful communication environment.

Prevention

- The country-related experiences presented in the workshop were deemed relevant and comprehensive.
- Several main differences have been highlighted within and between the Alpine countries:
 - Differences in the governance and coordination of the actors responsible for prevention across the alpine area.
 - Difference in the types of technical systems implemented in the various Alpine regions.
 - Differences concerning the criteria for financing, the types of measures eligible for financing and in types of funds used.
- Therefore, the possible benefits of a higher internal and trans-alpine coordination emerged.
- Some factors that may favour or hinder a broader application of prevention measures have also been highlighted:
 - Economic factors: prevention measures may be seen as an investment that is not generating revenues.
 - Competences: in some cases it is unclear under which sector the financing and management of prevention measures should be allocated.
 - Promotion: the promotion of agri-environmental measures by the relevant actors and associations is a key factor. If the respective associations and agricultural advisers promote the measures, they could be more efficiently spread.
 - Integration in financing programmes: the integration of measures for prevention in financing programmes, especially local ones, could be an encouraging factor.
 - Training: the training of all involved actors on the various prevention systems is essential.
 - Quality of the technical installations: these should be done with certified materials by competent staff in the presence of the farmers/shepherds.
 - Acceptance: a low acceptance of specific measures can hinder their application. In some cases, a very low acceptance is present.
 - Simplification of processes: simplifying processes for applying and receiving financing can have a positive impact on the use of prevention measures.
 - Control of the applied measures: it is important to find ways to effectively support farmers also in the correct implementation of measures.

Working closely with farmers is essential.

- Communication: sharing experiences (“go and see”) can be of help. It is important to give correct and appropriate information on the different prevention measures and their effectiveness, providing informed options.
- Holistic approach: all governance levels and actors should be involved.
- Local factors: specific weather conditions, cultural factors, habits and traditions can strongly influence the use or non-use of prevention measures.
- The option of zoning has not been deemed as an appropriate alternative.

Compensation

The discussion on compensation also highlighted a variety of different systems within and across the Alpine countries.

- The legal context providing the basis for compensation opportunities differs among the single Alpine countries.
- Guidelines could lead to a more efficient use of compensation.
- Several elements that could lead to more successful compensation systems have been identified:
 - Time: the time between the occurrence of the event and the compensation should be shorter.
 - Bureaucratic effort involved: less bureaucracy could lead to a better implementation of compensation systems.
 - Clarity of the procedure: all actors involved should have a

clear understanding of the required steps.

- Communication: both the existence of the possibility of compensation and the respective procedures have to be clearly and broadly communicated.
- The issue of broader consequences of attacks by large carnivores (e.g. stress) has been tackled; the discussion highlighted different systems and approaches in the Alps.
- The correlation between compensation and prevention has been discussed from two perspectives. On the one hand, foreseeing the need of having prevention measures in place when applying for compensation can encourage the application of prevention and insurance by farmers, while, on the other hand, making prevention measures compulsory may negatively affect acceptance in the long run.
- An exhaustive discussion on compensation should also take into account the *de minimis* regimes and the state aid regulation.

Excursion – day 2

On day 2, an excursion to the *Agriturismo* (mountain farm with accommodation) “La Tensa” was organised. During the visit, the owner Luciano Falcini explained the project of revitalisation of the abandoned group of houses and of reintroduction of the cultivation of grapes. He showed the damages caused by ungulates and the prevention measures that the *agriturismo* has in place.

After lunch, a series of local projects were presented by the following representatives:

Cristina Movalli from the Val Grande National Park presented the park in general and the situation concerning ungulates (especially wild boar) and their damages.

Radames Bionda from the Ossola Protected Areas also presented the situation in the area and gave an update on the presence of lynx.

Lorena Croppi and Riccardo Maccagno, from the local police of the Verbano Cusio Ossola area, illustrated the former procedure of notification of damages by large carnivores, which was previously managed by the local police, and compared it with the current system.

Roberto Viganò, scientific responsible of the project “Eco-food value chains processes” explained the approach of this project dealing with the valorisation of local game in a controlled value chain which, at the same time, helps to prevent poaching.



Figure 3: The view from Agriturismo La Tensa (ph. Marianna Elmi).

The Platform “Large carnivores, wild ungulates and society” of the Alpine Convention would like to thank:

Ars.Uni.VCO, in particular Andrea Cottini and Federica Fili for their support in the organization.

All the presenters and participants in the workshop for their contributions and their fruitful and constructive discussions.

Radames Bionda, Lorena Croppi, Riccardo Maccagno, Cristina Movalli and Roberto Viganò for sharing their experiences at local level.

In memory of Elena Tironi and her engagement and invaluable contribution to the conservation of large carnivores as well as of Luciano Falchini and his hospitality and dedication for the valorisation of his mountains.

Attachment 1

Workshop programme



Alpine Convention Platform “Large Carnivores, Wild Ungulates and Society” (WISO)

International Workshop

“Prevention and compensation of damages from large carnivores”

Final programme and information

Place: Domodossola (IT), Alpine Convention Infopoint Domodossola, Istituto Mellerio Rosmini, Via Rosmini 24, 28845 Domodossola, Italy.

Date: 27-28.02.2018 followed by a WISO meeting on 1.3.2018 (WISO members only).

Registration: the WISO Platform members and the invited experts are kindly invited to confirm their participation before February 2, 2018 by writing to wiso@alpconv.org. The participants are invited to specify in their registration any specific dietary requirements (e.g. vegetarian, gluten-free). The participants agree to bear the travel and accommodation costs related to their attendance to the workshop. The Permanent Secretariat of the Alpine Convention cordially invites all experts attending the workshops for lunch and coffee breaks as well as for the workshop dinner (27.02) and excursion lunch (28.02).

Working language: English.

Moderation: Marianna Elmi (Permanent Secretariat of the Alpine Convention, chair of the WISO Platform).

Concept: The workshop will be informative and interactive and will combine keynotes and experts presentations with moderated discussions and an excursion. The activity contributes to the implementation of the 2017 – 2018 WISO mandate.

Main aims:

1. **Analysing the state-of-art:** sharing knowledge on prevention and compensation measures for damages by large carnivores already in place in the Alps;
2. **Setting priorities:** identifying the most important and effective prevention and compensation measures;
3. **Identifying challenges:** highlighting the main challenges related to an effective and efficient system of prevention and compensation measures;
4. **Finding solutions:** highlighting possible solutions to the identified challenges, based also on effective systems presented in the state-of-art review;
5. **Finding financing tools:** deepening the understanding of the use of the European Agricultural Rural Development Fund (EARDF), the European Rural Development Fund (ERDF) as well as other financing solutions for damage prevention and compensation.

Day 1

27.02.2018, 13:00 – 18:00

13:00 Get-together and snack

13:45 Opening of the workshop, welcome by Markus Reiterer (Secretary General of the Alpine Convention) and Andrea Cottini (Alpine Convention Infopoint Domodossola)
Setting the general concept for the day

14:15 **Keynote 1:** Experiences beyond the Alps: "Wolf damage management in the Apennines: strategies for prevention and compensation across different Regions"
(*Valeria Salvatori and Paolo Ciucci*)

14:45 **Session 1:** "Damage prevention and compensation in the Alps – status quo, priorities and challenges"
Presentations (Representatives of the WISO Platform and other invited guests) on the status of prevention and compensation systems in the Alpine area.

- Catherine de Roince (Terröiko, France): "Damage prevention and compensation systems in the French Alps"
- Rok Černe (Slovenia Forest Service) "Damage prevention and compensation systems in the Slovene Alps"
- Claudio Groff (Autonomous Province of Trento): "Bear attacks on humans in Trentino: a new management challenge"
- Francesca Marucco (Life WolfAlps): "Prevention of wolf damage in the Italian Alps: state of art, challenges, priorities and possible solutions"

15:45 Coffee break

16:00 **Session 1:** continues

- Olivier Nägele (Liechtenstein Office for the Environment): "Damage prevention and compensation systems in Liechtenstein"
- Georg Rauer (University of veterinary medicine, Vienna): "Damage compensation systems and first steps in damage prevention in the Austrian Alps"
- Mirjam Pewsner (Swiss Federal Office for the Environment): "Damage prevention and compensation systems in the Swiss Alps"
- Manfred Wölfl (Bavarian Office for the Environment): "Damage prevention and compensation systems in the German Alps"

17:00 **Session 1:** Discussion in break-out groups on the following topics, based on the systems presented:

1. Main challenges to be tackled and priorities;
2. Main issues in implementing prevention/compensation systems in the Alps;
3. Communication with stakeholders and public: challenges, bottlenecks and positive experiences.

18:00 End of day 1

19:30 "0 Km" dinner at "Locanda Piemonte da Sciolla" in the city center of Domodossola.

Day 2

28.02.2018, 09:15 – 16:00

09:15 Reports with results from break-out groups from day 1

10:00 **Keynote 2:** “EADRF funds for financing mechanisms for damage prevention. Insights and experiences from the EU Platform on Coexistence between People and Large Carnivores”
(Katrina Marsden, *Adelphi - EU Platform Secretariat*)

10:30 **Session 2:** “Damage prevention and compensation in the Alps – financing opportunities”
Discussion in break-out groups. Topics:

- EADRF and other EU funds: experiences and application, good examples and limitations;
- Other financing systems for damage prevention and compensation: examples, opportunities and limitations;
- Priorities for structuring financing systems.

11:00 Coffee break

11:20 **Session 2:** Break-out groups - continuation

12:00 Presentation of the results of the Break-out session 2 and closing of the workshop

Excursion on the topic “Damage from ungulates and mountain agriculture: examples of compensation and prevention in the Domodossola area”.

12:45 – 16:00 Visit to the mountain farm “La Tensa” to see the measures in place for the prevention of damages by ungulates. Discussion with the owners and light lunch. Q&A on damage prevention and compensation with representatives of the local provincial police (responsible for managing the notification of damages), representatives of the Val Grande Nature Park and the Protected areas Val d’Ossola. Presentation of a project for the valorization of local game.

The excursion place will be reached by minibus and a short walk (approximately 1 km). Although the road is suitable for vehicles, we kindly ask the participants to be prepared with sturdy shoes and clothing appropriate for the outdoor weather of a late February afternoon.

A limited number of participants who do not wish to walk can be transported by car. Please inform the organizers directly at the beginning of the meeting.

Attachment 2

Participants list

Surname	Name	Institution
Aragno	Paola	ISPRA
Berce	Tomaž	Slovenia Forest Service
Belardi	Mauro	Eliante
Bionda	Radames	Ossola protected areas
Calderola	Sonia	Regione Veneto
Cerne	Rok	Slovenian Forest Service
Cottini	Andrea	Ars. UNI. VCO
Croppi	Lorena	Local Provincial Police
De Roince	Catherine	Étude territoriale Terroïko
Elmi	Marianna	Permanent Secretariat of Alpine Convention
Favilli	Filippo	Eurac Research
Ferjančič Lakota	Taja	Permanent Secretariat of Alpine Convention
Fili	Federica	Ars. UNI. VCO
Fischer	Markus	Austrian Chamber of Agriculture
Frick	Cathérine	Liechtenstein Office of Environment
Groff	Claudio	Autonomous Province of Trento
Heindl	Daniel	Austrian Chamber of Agriculture
Janovski	Martin	Land Tirol
Jonozovič	Marko	Slovenia Forest Service
Lohner	Peter	German Federal Ministry of Food and Agriculture
Lüthi	Riccarda	AGRIDEA Switzerland
Maccagno	Riccardo	Provincial police
Marsden	Katrina	Adelphi – Secretariat EU Platform coexistence people and large carnivores

Surname	Name	Institution
Marucco	Francesca	Life WolfAlps project
Menzano	Arianna	Centro grandi carnivori
Meyer	François	AGRIDEA Switzerland
Movalli	Cristina	Parco Nazionale Val Grande
Nägele	Olivier	Liechtenstein Office of Environment
Pewsner	Mirjam	Swiss Federal Office for the Environment
Pichler	Christian	WWF International
Rauer	Georg	University of Veterinary Medicine Vienna
Rizo	Sylvie	French Ministry of Agriculture
Rossi	Elisabetta Maria	Regione Lombardia
Salvatori	Valeria	Life WolfAlps project
Schölzel	Sara	Bavarian Environment Agency
Stauder	Julia	Eurac Research
Steyer	Katharina	German federal Agency for Nature Conservation
Vebr	Marianne	French Ecology Ministry
Wintzer	Wolfgang	Bavarian Ministry for Food, Agriculture and Forestry
Wölfel	Manfred	Bavarian Environment Agency
Wülser	Barbara	CIPRA International